

# “Best Tradition”: CREATE, JCSEE and the Program Evaluation Standards

**JMDE**  
Journal of MultiDisciplinary Evaluation

ISSN 1556-8180  
<http://www.jmde.com>

Corrie Rebecca Klinger

*Te Kura Toi Tangata School of Education, University of Waikato*

Don A. Klinger

*Te Wānanga Toi Tangata – Division of Education, University of Waikato*

**Background:** Evaluation “is a task in the best tradition of the most abstract theoretical science as well as the most practical applied science” (Scriven, 1968, p.9). The Program Evaluation Standards of the Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation (JCSEE) operationalize the theoretical aspects of evaluation and, when used, facilitate sound evaluation methods in applied settings. Between the publications of the first and second editions of The Program Evaluation Standards, the Center for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE) was funded in 1990 at Western Michigan University with federal monies of \$5.2 million, and between 1990 and 1995 by the United States Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI). CREATE was established for the betterment of evaluation within the educational context (Stufflebeam, 1991; Stufflebeam & Shinkfield, 1994). CREATE’s mandate and subsequent mission furthered the work of the Program Evaluation Standards and the JCSEE by using the standards in applied settings. Keeping to Scriven’s notion of evaluation as the best tradition, the collaborative work between CREATE and JCSEE is a well-established tradition that furthers the development of theoretical aspects of evaluation and the application of the evaluation standards.

**Purpose:** Examine CREATE’s impact on the Program Evaluation Standards’ theoretical development and applied use.

**Setting:** Not applicable.

**Intervention:** Not applicable

**Research Design:** Not applicable.

**Data Collection and Analysis:** Systematic review of the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards in the books, journal articles, monographs, special papers, meeting minutes, conference programs, and presentations associated with CREATE.

**Findings:** CREATE has contributed to the operationalization of the theoretical aspects of evaluation with the Program Evaluation Standards and facilitated their use in applied settings. CREATE has also furthered the work of the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Classroom Assessment Standards (formerly the Student Evaluation Standards). Leading scholars from CREATE and the JCSEE have contributed to the standards since the 1990s. Members of CREATE have published a notable range of books, journal articles, monographs, special papers and conference presentations related to the Program Evaluation Standards. Organizational capacity and shared goals of both the JCSEE and CREATE guided the practical application and theoretical development of the Program Evaluation Standards.

**Keywords:** *Program Evaluation Standards; Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teaching Effectiveness; Joint Committee for Standards on Educational Evaluation.*

## Introduction

Evaluation: mentioning the word frequently brings about adverse reactions such as avoidance or ambivalence. Such reactions are an issue of collective concern, given the importance of evaluation across contexts. Notwithstanding any negative connotation, evaluation “is a task in the best tradition of the most abstract theoretical science as well as the most practical applied science” (Scriven, 1968, p. 9). Notably, the Joint Committee for Standards on Educational Evaluation (JCSEE) has risen above negative sentiment toward evaluation and has longevity as a leader in the field. Within “the context of the failures of evaluation in the early years of the U.S. War on Poverty programs of the 1960s and 1970s,” the JCSEE began its work with the development of the Program Evaluation Standards in 1981 (Stufflebeam, 2004, p. 100). The Program Evaluation Standards have established a shared terminology and systematic approach for commissioning or conducting evaluations through the five attributes of evaluation: utility, feasibility, propriety, accuracy, and accountability. The JCSEE has maintained a systematic review and modification process for the standards, including field testing, national panel development, and stakeholder reviews, thus contributing to the theoretical and applied science of evaluation.

The first edition of *The Program Evaluation Standards* was published in 1981, with a second edition published in 1994. Between the publications of the first and second editions, the Center for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE) was funded in 1990 at Western Michigan University with federal monies of \$5.2 million, and for the years 1990 to 1995 by the United States Department of Education, Office of Educational Research and Improvement (OERI). CREATE was established for the betterment of evaluation within the educational context (Stufflebeam, 1991; Stufflebeam & Shinkfield, 1994). According to Stufflebeam,

CREATE’s federal mandate calls for it to be the focal point for United States efforts to improve measurement criteria, instruments, and procedures for evaluating the performance of teachers, administrators, and programs in both public and private schools. Consistent with this intent, CREATE has a strong field orientation ... CREATE will attempt to advance the theory and practice of evaluation in four domains, evaluation of teacher performance, evaluation of administrator performance, evaluation of

auxiliary professional personnel, and evaluation of schools. (1991, pp. 86-87)

CREATE’s mandate furthered the work of the Program Evaluation Standards and explicitly brought these standards into the work of schools. Relatedly, JCSEE’s Personnel Evaluation Standards, first published in 1988, were aligned with CREATE’s mandate.

As CREATE’s work progressed along with the development and dissemination of the JCSEE standards, it became clear that the Center would not receive federal funding past 1995, and CREATE convened interested persons in 1994 and 1995 to make sense of the state of affairs to plot a path forward or disband (Stufflebeam & Egelson, 2016; Hanssen, 1996). The sizeable number of interested persons made it possible for CREATE to move forward by transforming the federally funded Center into a professional organization. While together in 1995, one of the first items in the order of business was to draft the new organization’s mission. The mission was “to provide a forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of personnel and program evaluation research, policy and practice in education” (Hanssen, 1996, p. 8). With this mission, CREATE facilitated the use of the Program Evaluation Standards and Personnel Evaluation Standards. By 2006, CREATE expanded its mission to address the standards explicitly:

- (a) to advance the field of educational evaluation through a national forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of sound practices of personnel, student, and program evaluation research and policy;
- (b) to facilitate a network among those who actively engage in personnel, program and/or student evaluations and those who benefit from such evaluations; and
- (c) to promote the development, dissemination, knowledge, and use of the personnel, program, and student evaluation standards as issued by the Joint Committee on Standards in Educational Evaluation. (Muñoz, 2006, p. 2)

The work of CREATE has been to mobilize the evaluation standards of the JCSEE.

Keeping to Scriven’s (1968) notion of evaluation as a task in the best tradition, the collaborative work between CREATE and JCSEE was established to further the development of the theoretical science and application of the evaluation standards. CREATE members use the Program Evaluation Standards in educational settings such as school districts and post-secondary institutions. A notable range of books, journal

articles, monographs, special papers, and conference presentations have come to fruition with the collaboration between CREATE and JCSEE.

The purpose of this examination was to make sense of CREATE's impact on the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards, including earlier versions such as *Standards for Evaluations of Educational Programs, Projects, and Materials*. Although this examination may seem to present CREATE's perspective, the evidence demonstrates the interconnected work of leading scholars and practitioners within CREATE and JCSEE. The body of work generated by CREATE and JCSEE has contributed to theoretical and applied evaluation work since the 1990s and continues today. Organizational capacity and the shared goals of JCSEE and CREATE guided the practical application and theoretical development of the Program Evaluation Standards.

## Methods

For this systematic review to examine CREATE's impact on the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards, we identified and interpreted relevant information from a range of sources while pulling from historical methods. Interpretations came from synthesizing and integrating applicable factual and evaluative conclusions. If multiple sources suggested similar phenomena, we believed there was sufficient evidence to draw a conclusion. With this approach, we were "matching construct to evidence ... inferring the meaning of things in another time and place" (Krathwohl, 2009, p. 609). We used historical methods to make sense of the information found in available sources. "History consists of discovery, selection, organization, and interpretation of evidence to describe a situation or to answer a question about past events" (Krathwohl, 2009, p. 605). Available sources reviewed were electronic and print books, journal articles, editorials, special papers, bylaws, annual conference proceedings, conference programs, calls for proposals for annual conferences, newsletters, the "CREATE News" updates published in the

*Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, and meeting minutes of the CREATE board of directors.

This systematic review included the interpretation of university and practitioner contributions to the theoretical and applied science of evaluation as operationalized with the Program Evaluation Standards. We analyzed over 206 available sources to make sense of CREATE's impact on the Program Evaluation Standards.

## Available Sources

According to David R. Krathwohl, historical studies' hallmarks are to "conduct a reasonably complete search for sources of evidence, indicate the sources of information, use primary sources..." (2009, p. 611). The descriptor "available" means sources were accessible in print or electronic form on the internet, including via EBSCOhost, ERIC, ProQuest Central, SpringerLink Journals, and Wiley Online Library, each were accessed through the electronic webpages of the University of Waikato or Queens University libraries. For example, we used SpringerLink Journals through the library of the University of Waikato to access "CREATE News" articles for the years 1997 through 2007 because the news articles were published in the *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education (JPPE)*.

Additionally, we accessed available sources using the platforms owned and managed by the CREATE organization: Dropbox, Google Workspace, the CREATE website, and archived materials from former CREATE websites. Examples of sources from these places include meeting minutes of the CREATE board of directors and conference programs. We analyzed and annotated sources to determine the author(s), information about the Program Evaluation Standards and publication date. When we found general information about the JCSEE or information about the Personnel Evaluation Standards, Student Evaluation Standards, and Classroom Assessment Standards, we annotated those sources to note people who worked on them and connections between CREATE and JCSEE and categorized under said headings.

Table 1.

Artifact	Number	Year(s)
Books	8	1981–2015
Journal Articles	49	1990–2019
Editorials <sup>a</sup>		1990–2020
Special papers	11	1990–2019
Bylaws	2	1980–2018
CREATE annual conference proceedings	1	2020
CREATE Conference programs <sup>b</sup>	11	1999–2021
CREATE Conference calls for proposals	9	2004–2022
CREATE News <sup>a</sup>	18	1997–2007
CREATE newsletters <sup>c</sup>	27	2003–2021
Meeting minutes, CREATE board of directors	70	2004–2022
Total	206	1980–2022

*Note.* This is not an exhaustive review of artifacts. Examination of records stored at The Evaluation Center at Western Michigan University was scheduled for 2021 but postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

<sup>a</sup> From the *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education* and the CREATE annual conference proceedings.

<sup>b</sup> Includes National Evaluation Institute <sup>c</sup> Published and disseminated by CREATE

Table 1 shows the type and number of the 353 sources reviewed for the years 1980 through 2022. Some of the sources examined were not as relevant to CREATE's use of the Program Evaluation Standards, so they have not been included in Table 1. Table 1 shows the 206 documents that included relevant information for this examination.

We set out to examine CREATE and JCSEE records stored at The Evaluation Center at Western Michigan University. However, the trip, planned for October 2021, was postponed due to complications of the COVID-19 pandemic (New Zealand's borders were closed). Hence, this is not an exhaustive review of sources. Even though we are confident that there are more relevant sources to review at The Evaluation Center, those sources will most likely enhance the conclusions found in this examination by offering more examples of how CREATE has used the Program Evaluation Standards.

### *Theory into Practice*

Examining CREATE's impact on the use of the Program Evaluation Standards led us to ask whether any activities or work came out of CREATE that contributed to the drafting of the Program Evaluation Standards. We also wondered whether and if so how CREATE furthered the work of the JCSEE to operationalize the theoretical foundation

of evaluation into standards for use in applied settings by educators, evaluators, and researchers.

### *Member Checking*

Member checking is a research approach to review conclusions for accuracy (Patton, 2015). Thus, member checking is a method to address issues of validity. For member checking, we reached out to key contributors, such as Past President and Jason Millman Award recipient, Robert Rodosky, to ensure accurate interpretations were made.

### *Member Contributions*

CREATE's mission explicitly states that CREATE would "promote the development, dissemination, knowledge, and use of the personnel, program, and student evaluation standards as issued by the Joint Committee on Standards in Educational Evaluation" (Muñoz, 2006, p. 2). CREATE has always brought together a mix of people from different types of evaluation work using the standards. From the inception of CREATE and subsequent mission statements, CREATE sought to impact evaluation across educational settings, classrooms, military education, and university courses, as well as for school and university administrative practices and accountability policies (Airasian, 1997; Muñoz, 2009; Rodosky, 2003; Stufflebeam, 1991). The mission led us to examine

contributions made by CREATE members from different roles and settings (such as educators in school districts or local departments of education in addition to university professors) to the use of the Program Evaluation Standards within different contexts.

CREATE's "strong field orientation" led us to examine CREATE's use of the Program Evaluation Standards in the field across educational settings (Stufflebeam, 1991, p. 86). In addition to finding out if CREATE facilitated the use of the standards across educational contexts, we explored whether CREATE contributed to any long-term sustainable impact on the Program Evaluation Standards' theoretical development and applied use. Specifically, CREATE's mandate furthered the work of the Program Evaluation Standards and explicitly brought these standards into the work of schools. We wanted to make sense of CREATE's short- or long-term impact. One way we examined short or long-term impact was to consider if only a small group or large group of CREATE members were associated with the Program Evaluation Standards or if CREATE's involvement with the standards was for a short or long period. If only a small group of people were involved with the standards, the impact would seem person dependent and not sustainable. Thus, CREATE's impact would be limited in scope and not far-reaching across the entire organization. On the flip side, if many CREATE members contributed to the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards over a long period, then we would believe that CREATE's impact furthered the work of the Program Evaluation Standards.

### *Authors of Seminal Works*

CREATE has always been committed to implementing sound evaluation principles in field settings. Consequently, for this systematic review, we judged the quality of CREATE's impact on the Program Evaluation Standards' theoretical development and applied use. We were not interested in merely tallying how often a given individual from CREATE appeared in the published literature as a promoter of the standards. We were more concerned with finding the use of sound evaluation principles from reputable authors and their impact across educational settings. In this quest, we accepted the notion that authors of seminal works, such as highly cited journal publications or books, tend to be considered reputable scholars. Therefore, we were interested in examining CREATE contributions to the standards made by authors of seminal works. For example,

Daniel Stufflebeam and Michael Scriven are reputable authors of seminal evaluation works. Stufflebeam's Context, Input, Process, Product Evaluation Model (CIPP) established a methodological approach to collect information about a program and then use the information collected to develop the program or design new programs (Stufflebeam, 1971; Stufflebeam & Shrinkfield, 1985). In evaluation, the concepts of formative and summative were first published by Scriven in 1967. Stufflebeam and Scriven are two examples of reputable authors of seminal works who contributed to the theoretical and applied science of evaluation with CREATE thus, impacted the standards of the JCSEE.

### **Background & Findings**

Since the 1990s, CREATE has prioritized supporting the work of JCSEE. Collaboratively with the JCSEE, CREATE has contributed to the theoretical and applied work of the Program Evaluation Standards and evaluation at large. The interconnected work of leading scholars and practitioners involved with CREATE and the JCSEE has contributed to the theoretical and applied evaluation work that continues today. In these ways, CREATE has furthered the dissemination, use, and development of the Program Evaluation Standards.

CREATE has contributed by being a part of standards development as chairpersons, committee members, task force members, facilitators, and participants in national hearings, validation panels, and the coordination of field testing. Relatedly, CREATE held special sessions at annual conferences devoted to seeking feedback about the Program Evaluation Standards when the standards were under review and when new editions were ready for publication.

CREATE has prompted the use of the standards by conducting workshops and conference sessions within which participants apply the Program Evaluation Standards to their evaluations. CREATE has incorporated the Program Evaluation Standards into the organization's strategic planning in the recent past. The Program Evaluation Standards have been essential to the annual CREATE conferences, serving as organizational strands that organized presentation topics. Through the years, members have made presentations at annual CREATE conferences to share how they used the Program Evaluation Standards. CREATE communications, such as newsletters, have been used for ongoing and

targeted correspondences to disseminate and promote the Program Evaluation Standards.

The organizational capacity and shared goals of the JCSEE and CREATE guided the practical application and theoretical development of the Program Evaluation Standards. The evidence presented here demonstrates the interconnected work of leading scholars who have served as members of both CREATE and the JCSEE. This interconnected work has contributed to the field of evaluation since the 1990s and continues today. Additionally, CREATE has impacted the development and use of the other sets of standards by the JCSEE, the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Classroom Assessment Standards (formerly the Student Evaluation Standards).

The Background and Findings section begins with CREATE's original mandate and mission and then shares relevant parts of CREATE's bylaws, and strategic planning initiatives, followed by sections about CREATE membership, publications, national hearings, and CREATE annual conferences, and concludes with findings related to the JCSEE's other standards: Personnel Evaluation Standards and Classroom Assessment Standards (formerly Student Evaluation Standards).

We would be remiss if we did not briefly mention CREATE's name changes. CREATE was founded in 1990 as the Center for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. The first board of directors suggested the name "Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation" in 1995 when CREATE became a professional organization. CREATE members adopted that name in 1996. In 2013, "Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teaching Effectiveness" became the new name. The rationale suggested that "accountability" connoted summative assessment, whereas the term "assessment" connoted formative and summative assessment. It stands to reason that CREATE expanded its mission to include program evaluation, thus moving the organization beyond the original teacher evaluation mandate. The board of directors seems to have believed that teaching effectiveness was more inclusive than teacher evaluation (CREATE Board of Directors, 2015). It does seem as if the name change in 2013 was intended to reduce the negative stigma associated with the term "evaluation" (Klinger & Klinger, 2021a).

### *Mandate and Mission*

As we explored the sources, it seemed appropriate to begin with CREATE's original mandate and

mission. The original mandate and mission, as articulated in 1995, connected well to the Program Evaluation Standards, and by 2006, CREATE's mission explicitly included the Program Evaluation Standards.

CREATE's 1990 mandate, found above in the introduction, furthered the work of the Program Evaluation Standards and brought these standards into the work of evaluation of public and private schools. Furthermore, "CREATE will attempt to advance the theory and practice of evaluation" is spot on with the essence of the Program Evaluation Standards. CREATE was founded in the "best tradition of the most abstract theoretical science as well as the most practical applied science" (Scriven, 1968, p. 9). Relatedly, the other aspects were aligned with JCSEE's Personnel Evaluation Standards, first published in 1988.

In 1995, as CREATE was ending its time as a federally funded center and becoming a professional organization, the new organization set forth with the mission "to provide a forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of personnel and program evaluation research, policy and practice in education" (Hanssen, 1996, p. 8). By 2006, CREATE expanded the mission, adding more specific wording about the ways CREATE would "promote the development, dissemination, knowledge, and use of the personnel, program, and student evaluation standards as issued by the Joint Committee on Standards in Educational Evaluation" (Muñoz, 2006, p. 2). With this more explicit mission, CREATE facilitated the use of the Program Evaluation Standards by advancing

the field of educational evaluation through a national forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of sound practices of personnel, student, and program evaluation research and policy ... and by facilitating a network among those who actively engage in personnel, program and/or student evaluations and those who benefit from such evaluations. (Muñoz, 2006, p. 2)

The CREATE board of directors considered changing the mission while developing a strategic plan between 2012 and 2015. An October 17, 2015, draft of possible changes to the mission was shared at the CREATE annual business meeting, but the organization did not make those changes; in 2018, the CREATE website still held CREATE to the mission articulated by Marco Muñoz in 2006. Even today, CREATE's mission explicitly intertwines with the Program Evaluation Standards.

From the original mandate through the 2000s, CREATE's mission set forth the expectation that the

organization would have a role in the development, dissemination, and use of the Program Evaluation Standards. CREATE would also be where the standards had a national forum for presentations and discussions to impact program evaluation research and policy.

### *CREATE Bylaws*

In addition to the original mandate and subsequent mission of CREATE, the CREATE bylaws show how the work of the two organizations meaningfully intersects and are pertinent to this examination of how CREATE furthers the work of the JCSEE. These bylaws embed representation on the JCSEE within CREATE's infrastructure and operating procedures. According to Article IV, Section 3.c. of the CREATE bylaws,

The CREATE Board of Directors shall appoint an active member of CREATE to serve as the Board's Representative to the Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation (JCSEE). The Representative shall sit on the Board of Directors as a non-voting member unless duly elected to the Board of Directors or as an elected official.

### *Strategic Planning*

CREATE has incorporated the Program Evaluation Standards into the organization's strategic planning in the recent past; from 2013 through 2015, strategic planning connected CREATE's mission and the work of the JCSEE. Strategic planning documents suggest CREATE sought to articulate intentional connections between the work of those within the consortium and the Program Evaluation Standards.

In 2012, the CREATE board of directors set some strategic goals for 2012 through 2015. Strategic Goal 1 related to redefining and committing to what it means to be a consortium. Within this goal, the board considered CREATE's role in the JCSEE. In 2013, Strategic Goal 1, II. c. had developed to include the following:

Rooted in the origins of CREATE at Western Michigan University, current CREATE members agree to uphold the highest ethical standards and to use best research-based practices in implementing classroom assessment, teacher assessment, teacher/leader evaluation, and program evaluation. (p. 2)

During the board of directors meeting on February 6, 2015, the board reviewed each element of the strategic plan in light of the CREATE name change of 2013. Based on the name change, the board considered making an "update to the bullets in the mission statement to include effectiveness and evaluation topics" (CREATE Board of Directors, 2015, p. 3). The board seemed engaged in ongoing deliberations about changing or keeping the three sets of evaluation standards of the JCSEE in the mission, but the board did not make changes to the mission.

As a part of strategic planning from 2013 to 2015, CREATE maintained the commitment to disseminating and developing the Program Evaluation Standards. Strategic planning during this period shows us that CREATE worked to build the networking capacity for CREATE members within the organization.

### *CREATE Membership*

Over the years, CREATE membership has stayed stable in that CREATE members represent educators, evaluators, policymakers, and researchers. CREATE members join as individuals, groups, or institutions. Educators within CREATE come from schools, school districts, departments of education, and universities. Research groups such as Guskey & Associates and the Marzano Group have been CREATE members. As far back as 1997, membership was available for "any individual or agency interested in school, personnel, and program evaluation" (Airasian, 1997, p. 91). The number of CREATE members who have attended the annual conference in any given year has fluctuated from over 500 to about 50.

CREATE members tend to honor and promote the organization's foundation of collaborative work with the JCSEE. Members have always maintained a collegial approach to working together, as described by Robert Rodosky in 2003:

It's been 13 years since this organization was founded. In looking at our history, our roots are in the quality standard-setting work performed by the Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. This work focused on Program Evaluation Standards (how to assess evaluations of educational programs); Personnel Evaluation Standards (how to assess systems for evaluating educational personnel); and Student Evaluation Standards (how to improve evaluations of students).

I find myself constantly being guided by this body of work. I also find myself asking fellow CREATE members for input on issues of school and teacher quality. The advice I receive is usually very helpful. This is because the background and experience of our members is diverse. Our individual members work in a variety of roles within education, including the following: teacher and administrator preparation and hiring; staff development; district and statewide testing and accountability; closing achievement gaps; research-based program development and effectiveness; and policy development at the district, state, and national levels. The other strength of our membership is the variety of settings they represent, including universities, public school districts, non-profit organizations and foundations; private schools; for-profit companies, independent consultants, and state and federal agency and government groups. And asking for help is easy! Unlike larger evaluation organizations, our size allows us to be more of an evaluation community with a common purpose (p. 1).

### *Publications*

Examining publications was a way to gauge CREATE's impact on the Program Evaluation Standards. Publications included books, journal articles, editorials, special papers, bylaws, annual conference proceedings of the Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teaching Effectiveness, CREATE Conference programs, CREATE Conference calls for proposals, CREATE news, and CREATE newsletters. Table 2 provides a timeline of publications related to the Program Evaluation Standards authored by CREATE members between 1980 and 2022. Included in Table 2 are the names of the CREATE members who have authored relevant publications.

The publications in Table 2 show that the JCSEE and CREATE have a history of working together to develop, disseminate, and use the Program Evaluation Standards. This working relationship extends to the JCSEE's other two sets of standards, the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Student Evaluation Standards, revised into the Classroom Assessment Standards. The collaborative history of JCSEE and CREATE working together makes sense because of shared leadership, as Stufflebeam led the formation of both. CREATE has continued to develop, disseminate and use the standards with JCSEE.

Table 2. Publications Related to the Program Evaluation Standards Authored by CREATE Members

Year	Name(s)	Title	Description
1980	R. Rodosky	JCSEE bylaws	Facilitated the drafting with others.
1981	D. L. Stufflebeam	<i>Standards for Evaluations of Educational Programs, Projects, and Materials</i>	Seminal publication.
1991	D. L. Stufflebeam	Introduction to the Center for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE).	Discussed the relationship between CREATE and JCSEE.
1994	J. R. Sanders	<i>Program Evaluation Standards: How to Assess Evaluations of Educational Programs</i> (2nd ed.)	Task force chair. Task force members R. Blank, W. T. Rogers and D. L. Stufflebeam were CREATE members.
1994	D. L. Stufflebeam A. Shinkfield	"About This Issue," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 8(2)	Disseminated information about the Program Evaluation Standards and published papers from the first annual NEI CREATE.
1996	C. Hanssen	"Beyond CREATE: The Beginnings of a New National Organization for Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 10(1)	CREATE changed from being a funded center to a professional organization. CREATE's mission in 1995 was "to provide a forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of personnel and program evaluation research, policy and practice in education" (p. 8).
1997	P. W. Airasian	"CREATE News," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 11(1)	Described activities of CREATE, JCSEE and information about the JCSEE standards.
1998	P. W. Airasian S. Horn	"CREATE News," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 11(4)	Described activities of CREATE, JCSEE and information about the JCSEE standards.
1999	Chad Ellet	"Special Editorial Announcements," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 13(3)	Described activities of CREATE, JCSEE and information about the JCSEE standards.
1999	NEI CREATE Program	Section about Daniel L. Stufflebeam's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture.	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.
2000	D. L. Stufflebeam	"The Methodology of Metaevaluation as Reflected in Metaevaluations by the Western Michigan University Evaluation Center," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 14(1)	Published lecture that Stufflebeam gave at NEI CREATE 1999 as the first recipient of the Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture.
2000	W. L. Sanders	"Value-Added Assessment from Student Achievement Data: Opportunities and Hurdles, CREATE NEI, July 21, 2000," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 14(4)	Published lecture that Sanders gave at NEI CREATE 2000 as the second recipient of the Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture.
2000	NEI CREATE Program	Section about William L. Sanders's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the JCSEE standards.
2000	P. W. Airasian S. Horn	"CREATE News," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 14(1)	Described the Program Evaluation Standards, activities of CREATE, JCSEE and the JCSEE standards.

2000	C. Ellett	"From the Editor," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 14(4)	Described the Program Evaluation Standards, activities of CREATE, JCSEE and the JCSEE standards.
2000	P. W. Airasian S. Horn	"CREATE News," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 14(4)	Described the Program Evaluation Standards, activities of CREATE, JCSEE and the JCSEE standards.
2001	C. Ellett	"From the Editor," <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 15(1)	Described the Program Evaluation Standards, activities of CREATE, JCSEE and the JCSEE standards.
2001	NEI CREATE Program	Section about Michael Scriven's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.
2003	R. Rodosky	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 7(1)	Discussed the JCSEE's three sets of standards.
2004	CREATE	"Call for Proposals," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 7(2)	Stated the JCSEE's three sets of standards were the basis for the 2004 NEI CREATE.
2004	D. L. Stufflebeam	"A Note on the Purposes, Development, and Applicability of the Joint Committee Evaluation Standards," <i>The American Journal of Evaluation</i> , 25(1)	Made connections between the work of CREATE and the standards of the JCSEE.
2004	NEI CREATE Program	Section about Peter W. Airasian's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the JCSEE standards.
2005	R. Rodosky	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 9(1)	Disseminated and discussed CREATE's contributions to the JCSEE standards.
2005	CREATE	<i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 9(1)	Disseminated and engaged CREATE membership in the application of the Program Evaluation Standards.
2006	K. Wetherill	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 10(1)	The 2006 NEI CREATE would focus on the three JCSEE standards.
2005	CREATE	<i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 10(1)	Disseminated and engaged CREATE membership in the application of the Program Evaluation Standards.
2006	M. A. Muñoz	Highlights of CREATE: Expanding Research and Promising Practices in Personnel, Program, and Student Evaluation, Special Issue 1/2 from the 2006 NEI CREATE, <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 19	Published papers in this issue from presentations given at the 2006 NEI CREATE and included the Program Evaluation Standards.
2007	M. A. Muñoz D. Davis	Improving Teaching and Learning through Evaluation: A Special Issue on the NEI CREATE, <i>Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education</i> , 20(3/4)	Published papers published were from presentations given at the 2007 NEI CREATE and included the Program Evaluation Standards.
2007	M. A. Muñoz	"Forthcoming Change on CREATE's Journal," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 11(1)	Disseminated the JCSEE's three sets of standards.
2008	M. A. Muñoz F. Chang	<i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 11(8)	Disseminated the JCSEE's three sets of standards.
2008	P. Egelson B. Howard	"JCSEE: Enhancing Personnel Evaluations through an Application of the Standards," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 11(2)	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.

---

2008	NEI CREATE Program	Section about A. R. Gullickson's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the JCSEE standards.
2009	CREATE Newsletter	Section introducing D. Stufflebeam as a keynote speaker	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.
2009	NEI CREATE Program	Section about R. Rodosky's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the JCSEE standards.
2010	B. Howard	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 13(1)	Shared that CREATE continued to be a home to those conducting or consuming program, personnel, and student evaluation.
2010	CREATE Newsletter	<i>CREATE Newsletter</i> with the images of the JCSEE's three sets of standards, 12(2)	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.
2010	B. Howard	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 13(4)	Shared that information sessions about the JCSEE Standards occurred at each NEI CREATE, and the 2010 NEI CREATE would focus on the third edition of the Program Evaluation Standards and the revision process starting for the Student Evaluation Standards.
2010	P. Egelson	"Joint Committee on Standards for Education Evaluation," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 13(3)	Provided an introduction and summary of the three sets of standards of the JCSEE along with cover images.
2011	D. B. Yarbrough R. Hopson <sup>a</sup>	<i>The Program Evaluation standards: How to Assess Evaluations of Educational Programs</i> (3rd ed.)	Joint JCSEE and CREATE members include R. Blank and P. Egelson.
2012	P. Egelson	"Message from the President," <i>CREATE Newsletter</i> , 16(1)	Discussed the close connections between CREATE and the JCSEE. Shared that CREATE members regularly published articles on evaluation and assessment topics to disseminate and promote the use of the standards.
2019	CREATE Program	Section about Donald B. Yarbrough's Jason Millman Memorial Award and Lecture	Disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards.
2022	CREATE call for proposals	CREATE website, createconference.org	Aligned proposals to one set of the JCSEE standards.

---

*Note.* Complete citations for all publications are included in the References section.

<sup>a</sup> Yarbrough and Hopson were CREATE members; Lyn Shulha and Flora Caruthers were also authors but not CREATE members.

The shared publication record of JCSEE and CREATE shows the collaborative and inclusive nature of the two organizations. Both organizations have sought inclusive, collaborative work with teachers, principals, superintendents, state education personnel, and evaluation researchers to develop the Program Evaluation Standards and put them into action. According to Stufflebeam and Egelson,

CREATE engaged a national group of collaborating organizations and individuals to work on improving personnel evaluation generally (especially evaluations of school principals, district superintendents, and support personnel) as well as evaluations of students and programs (2016, para. 1).

The publication record demonstrates the ways CREATE introduced the Program Evaluation Standards to members unfamiliar with the standards. CREATE also encouraged those familiar with the standards to apply them in their work in varied settings. Table 2 shows the long collaborative publication record between the JCSEE and CREATE specific to the *CREATE Contributions to the Program Evaluation Standards*.

#### *CREATE Contributions to the Program Evaluation Standards.*

Exemplifying the collaborative work across educational settings, Table 2 begins in 1980 with contributions by Robert Rodosky. He helped draft the bylaws for the JCSEE and the 1981 publication of *Standards for Evaluations of Educational Programs, Projects, and Materials*, the first edition of the Program Evaluation Standards. As two founding JCSEE members, Rodosky and Stufflebeam set the collaborative essence of the work into motion. Rodosky was assistant director of The Evaluation Center at Western Michigan University from 1978 to 1983. During his subsequent 32-and-a-half-year tenure with Jefferson County Public Schools (JCPS) in Louisville, Kentucky, he served as president of CREATE in 2004 and 2006. Rodosky wrapped up his work at JCPS as chief of data management, planning, and program evaluation in 2015 (Ross, 2015). Daniel L. Stufflebeam was the JCSEE's first chairperson and was instrumental in creating the Program Evaluation Standards in 1981. He served on the task force that wrote the second edition, published in 1994. In 1991, between the publication of the first and second editions, federal funding established CREATE to improve teacher

evaluation. Rodosky and Stufflebeam's multiple collaborative contributions across educational settings promoting and developing the abstract theoretical and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards are apparent from their publications (identified in Table 2).

This section explains contributions to the Program Evaluation Standards made by CREATE members and people who have held leadership positions in both organizations.

Members of CREATE have served as chairpersons and task force members for the second and third editions of the Program Evaluation Standards. James R. Sanders, a member of CREATE, led the development of the second edition of the Program Evaluation Standards as chairperson. Members of the second edition task force were also CREATE members, such as Rolf Blank, W. Todd Rogers and Daniel L. Stufflebeam. Arlen Gullickson, a member and former President of CREATE, was chair of the JCSEE from 1998 to 2008. Rolf Blank and Paula Egelson, members of the JCSEE on the second edition, also served as influential members of CREATE. Relatedly, members of CREATE on the task force for the third edition were Don Yarbrough and Rodney Hopson. Gullickson, Egelson, and Klinger also served on the CREATE board of directors and as presidents of CREATE. Table 2 shows the contributions and publications made by CREATE members and people in leadership positions.

According to Richard L. Schwab, CREATE and JCSEE had much in common with the *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education (JPEE)* because they shared "...the goal of generating informed debate, disagreement, and controversy" (1990, p. 5). These commonalities made for a working relationship to publish "CREATE News" in the JPEE from 1997 through 2007. In 1997, the editors of the *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education* shared that CREATE would have space "in each issue to make organizational announcements, contribute organizational news, and so on." Peter W. Airasian wrote the first article about CREATE (Ellett et al., 1997, p. 5). Around 2003, CREATE began publishing a printed newsletter that was mailed and emailed to members. The publication of the CREATE newsletter encouraged those familiar with the standards to apply them in their work in educational settings, such as school districts and post-secondary institutions. The newsletters kept members informed of the revisions to the Program Evaluation Standards. In 2009, JPEE changed its name to *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*. Table 2 provides a list (including

dates) of CREATE members' publications related to the Program Evaluation Standards.

Members of CREATE have promoted the knowledge and use of the Program Evaluation Standards among practicing evaluators and applied evaluation scholars. Publications and ongoing communications such as "CREATE News," CREATE newsletters for targeted communications, and CREATE Conference calls for proposals developed and disseminated the Program Evaluation Standards for over 30 years. The published CREATE Conference calls for proposals show that CREATE has made concerted efforts to disseminate the Program Evaluation Standards through the years. In subsequent sections, we present more information about CREATE Conference themes, strands, presentations, and calls for proposals.

CREATE has promoted awareness of the JCSEE and the Program Evaluation Standards by being a part of the development of the standards as chairpersons, committee members, and task force members for multiple editions of the Program Evaluation Standards, as seen in the record of published journal articles, editorials, and special papers found in Table 2. The entire time CREATE has existed, practitioners and researchers have cut across organizational lines to contribute to the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards. The publication record shown in Table 2 demonstrates CREATE's commitment to a strong field orientation. The CREATE news published in the JPEE and the CREATE newsletters were ongoing communications that provided information with relevant links to JCSEE for disseminating the Program Evaluation Standards. The calls for proposals demonstrate the annual work at CREATE conferences to communicate the standards and make the standards relevant to the work of CREATE members.

### *CREATE Annual Conferences*

According to Peter W. Airasian, at each year's CREATE conference, a "mix of attendees... provided a unique opportunity for educators with different perspectives and concerns to discuss issues and to form mutual assistance networks" (1997, p. 90). In 2003, Rodosky said, "CREATE provides an opportunity to interact within a network of professionals and to view educational evaluation from a variety of perspectives" (p. 1). Later, in 2009, Muñoz added,

More importantly, our annual conference will provide an important opportunity to reflect in the quality of our work as we support the education with our nation's children. We need to have clear that our profession makes sense when we place students at the forefront of our work. CREATE, as a community of professionals, develop their collective wisdom and creativity through this kind of annual exchanges. We need to stay connected with our colleagues doing similar work so that we can do the very best work in our demanding field. CREATE is a relatively small organization but a national leader of research and evaluation. We pride ourselves on our strong networking and collegial support (p.1).

Networking and collaboration have always been central to CREATE. CREATE is where classroom teachers, school district administrators, early career researchers and others have time to interact with top scholars in the field. For example, the 2010 conference:

included outstanding national speakers like Diane Ravitch, James Popham, Thomas Guskey, and James Stronge among others. Our format includes paper presentation sessions and poster sessions... that offer anyone interested in discussing his/her work opportunities to share in a relaxed atmosphere. This type of networking and feedback is particularly invaluable to those in the developing stages of a project (Howard, 2010c, p.1).

According to Barbara Howard, president of CREATE and longtime contributor to the JCSEE standards, CREATE has offered

... invaluable networking opportunities to professionals across the country since its inception over two decades ago. It continues in that tradition (2010d).

Reaching outside of the United States of America, CREATE has provided an international and varied audience for disseminating and using the Program Evaluation Standards. CREATE "presenters included teachers, principals, superintendents, evaluation researchers, and state education personnel" (Airasian, 1997, p, 90). According to John Fischetti,

As an organization CREATE enters a vital period in its long history. Our Board and members are poised to rekindle our founding

premise to connect the best research in the field to current practice. In the meantime, we are expanding our international base of membership in Canada and Australia. (2014, p. 1)

“Our conference was international in scope with presenters and participants attending from the United States, Canada, the Far East and the Middle East,” asserted Paula Egelson (2014, p. 2).

The Program Evaluation Standards have also been essential to the annual CREATE conference. According to Howard,

CREATE, as a member organization of the Joint Committee for Standards in Educational Evaluation (JCSEE), involves its membership directly in the important work of development and revision of three sets of standards issued by the JCSEE—student, personnel, and program. (2010d, p. 1)

Similar to many academic and professional organizations, presentations at CREATE conferences have been organized into topics or content areas called strands. Most CREATE conferences, including the 2022 CREATE Conference, organized presentations into strands using the JCSEE standards.

CREATE’s impact on developing the theoretical and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards extends to the facilitation of national hearings, CREATE Conference themes and strands, and special sessions and presentations at annual conferences. Annual conferences demonstrate the intentional, collaborative work of teachers, principals, superintendents, evaluators, researchers, and state education personnel. Table 3 shows CREATE Conference activities linked to JCSEE standards, emphasizing the Program Evaluation Standards. Table 4 shows CREATE Conference presentations specific to Program Evaluation Standards from 1997 through 2021.

Table 3. CREATE Conference Activities Linked to JCSEE Standards

Year	Activities Linked to JCSEE	Title
2004	Strands	Program Evaluation Standards, Personnel Evaluation Standards, Classroom Assessment Standards
2006	Theme	Expanding Research and Promising Practices in Personnel, Program, and Student Evaluation
2006	Post-Conference Sessions	Personnel Evaluation with Dr. Barbara Howard, Student Evaluation with Dr. Arlen Gullickson, and Program Evaluation with Dr. Don Yarbrough
2008	National Hearings	National Hearing on JCSEE Standards
2009	Strands	Program Evaluation Standards, Personnel Evaluation Standards, Classroom Assessment Standards
2010	Strands	Program Evaluation Standards, Personnel Evaluation Standards, Classroom Assessment Standards
2022	Strands	Program Evaluation Standards, Personnel Evaluation Standards, Classroom Assessment Standards

*Note.* This is not an exhaustive review of artifacts for each year of CREATE. Examination of records stored at The Evaluation Center at Western Michigan University was scheduled for 2021 but postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

Structuring annual conferences around the standards of the JCSEE has been a way CREATE has lived its mission. CREATE has used the

standards as conference strands and themes. The standards have been the CREATE Conference strands in 2004, 2009, 2010, and 2022. According

to Howard, the 2010 CREATE conference included presenters from 23 states:

With threads pulling together our three strands of evaluation of student performance, teacher evaluation, and program evaluation, we plan to offer many opportunities for engaging conversations among educators from across the country and beyond in these three key areas of education. (2010d. p. 1)

Available sources show that the theme for the annual conference in 2006 was “Expanding Research and Promising Practices in Personnel, Program, and Student Evaluation.”

*National Hearings.* CREATE co-hosted the national hearing on JCSEE standards in 2008 as a series of post-conference sessions after the annual

CREATE conference, as shown in Table 3. Over the years, as the standards have undergone review and development, CREATE members have served as panel participants, reviewers, facilitators, and participants in national hearings and coordinated field testing. One of the strengths of the development process for evaluation standards has always been the national hearings. These national hearings, hosted by JCSEE member organizations, provided a national and international forum to review and discuss revisions to the standards. Each national hearing is distinct, given its membership, and these distinctions further add to the credibility and generalizability of each set of evaluation standards from the Joint Committee. As a result, each writing task force has an opportunity to consider current issues and discuss ways to ensure the standards encapsulate these issues.

Table 4. CREATE Conference Presentations Specific to Program Evaluation Standards, 1997–2021

Year	Author	Title	Description
1999	Daniel Stufflebeam	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2000	William L. Sanders	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2001	Michael Scriven	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2004	Peter W. Airasian	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2004	Carol Anne Dwyer, Robert Linn, Robert Marzano	Keynote addresses	Keynote addresses included references to <i>the Program Evaluation Standards</i>
2004	Arlen R. Gullickson, Barbara Howard, & Paula Egelson	The Program Evaluation Standards	Presentation about how the Program Evaluation Standards provide valuable guidance for anyone who conducts or commissions an evaluation for the purpose of improving education and learning. This session demonstrated how the standards address issues such as design, data collection, analysis of information, reporting and other tasks associated with program evaluation.

2008	Arlen R. Gullickson	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2009	Robert Rodosky	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2009	Daniel L. Stufflebeam	Keynote address	Address included references to the Program Evaluation Standards
2010	Paula Egelson et al.	Using the Program Evaluation Standards to Assist in Implementing an Alternative School Program Evaluation	Discussion about how to integrate Program Evaluation Standards into program evaluation work. Discussed an evaluation of an alternative school program within which evaluators incorporated the standards.
2012	James H. Stronge	Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture	Lecture included references to the JCSEE standards
2016	Arlen R. Gullickson	A Focus on Standards Research	Encouraged CREATE research on the JCSEE standards—the merit, worth, and significance of those standards when implemented. Gullickson challenged CREATE and JCSEE to plot a path by joining forces to establish a research planning team and create small and specific congruence. He also suggested ongoing contingency analyses of the use of the three sets of standards put out by the JCSEE, along with looking for ways to inject research into ongoing funded projects.
2018	Paula Egelson, Rebecca Purser, & Chris Fuga	Implementing the Program Evaluation Standards in Real-Time Settings	The Program Evaluation Standards were created by the Joint Committee on Standards for Education Evaluation. These 30 standards are organized around five key attributes: utility, feasibility, propriety, accuracy and accountability. The session examined common evaluation issues in relation to the PES. Discussed how PES can be used to resolve evaluation issues and strengthen the evaluation process.
2019	Donald B. Yarbrough	2019 Jason Millman Award Recipient & Lecturer	Lecture included references to the Program Evaluation Standards

2021	Corrie R. Klinger & Don A. Klinger	Unresolved Controversy: Assessment & Evaluation	Discussed the controversial nature of evaluation and assessment, referenced Program Evaluation Standards
------	------------------------------------	---	--

*Note.* This is not an exhaustive review of presentations for each year of CREATE. Examination of records stored at The Evaluation Center at Western Michigan University was scheduled for 2021 but postponed due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

*Special Sessions at Annual Conferences.* CREATE has a history of disseminating the standards at conferences, presentations, and special sessions. CREATE members who have served on the JCSEE or its task forces have facilitated national review panels and hearings, served as reviewers of the standards and put on special sessions at the CREATE conferences. Special session topics have included the Jason Millman Memorial Award and lecture, keynote addresses, and sessions focused solely on the Program Evaluation Standards. CREATE held special sessions and presentations devoted to the Program Evaluation Standards when the standards were under review, and new editions were ready for publication. Table 4 shows special sessions and presentations from CREATE conferences specific to the Program Evaluation Standards.

*Presentations at Annual Conferences.* Over the years, the Program Evaluation Standards have been the focus of presentations at the CREATE conference. Members have made presentations sharing how they have used the Program Evaluation Standards. Table 4 shows conference presentations specific to the Program Evaluation Standards. Please note that this is not an exhaustive list.

### *Other Standards, Personnel Evaluation Standards, and Classroom Assessment Standards*

The above sections discussed CREATE's impact on the Program Evaluation Standards. This section demonstrates CREATE's contributions to the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Classroom Assessment Standards (formerly Student Evaluation Standards). Influential CREATE members led the standards' development as chairpersons, members of task forces who developed the work, coordinators of field tests, national panels, and reviewers for the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Classroom Assessment Standards. Development activities

include facilitating and participating in national standard-setting panels and publications. Appendix A contains CREATE's contributions to each set of standards. Publications about the Personnel Evaluation Standards and the Classroom Assessment Standards are shown holistically and chronologically, along with the Program Evaluation Standards publications found in Table 2.

CREATE's original mandate suggested CREATE would spend 60% of its effort "on improving evaluation of teacher performance" (Stufflebeam, 1991, p. 87). Hence, CREATE devoted many initial efforts to teacher evaluation and Personnel Evaluation Standards. According to Stufflebeam and Egelson, CREATE "played the lead role in developing the first set of national *Personnel Evaluation Standards*" (2016, para. 1). CREATE was established to improve teacher evaluation, a form of personnel evaluation. We share this reference (even though the Personnel Evaluation Standards are beyond the scope of our focus here) to demonstrate the history of collaboration between the JCSEE and CREATE to develop and use evaluation standards. In 1988, the JCSEE published the Personnel Evaluation Standards; the second edition was published in 2009.

For the 2009 second edition, CREATE member Arlen R. Gullickson was the chair of the JCSEE, and Barbara Howard was the task force chair. Members of the task force included these CREATE members: Peter W. Airasian, Don A. Klinger, W. Todd Rogers, Jerry Horn, James R. Sanders, and Daniel L. Stufflebeam. Over the years, these CREATE members made presentations about these standards at the CREATE conferences. They also published and disseminated information about the standards in the CREATE newsletters. Incidentally, Jerry Horn also served as president of CREATE.

Also beyond the scope of our work here but essential to explaining the collaborative history of how CREATE members work with the JCSEE are the Student Evaluation Standards, first published in 2003 and revised into the Classroom Assessment Standards in 2015.

Arlen R. Gullickson, a longtime member of CREATE, led the development of the Student

Evaluation Standards of 2003. Another member of CREATE, James R. Sanders, served as chair of the JCSEE before Gullickson. Committee members who were also CREATE members include Rolf Blank, Paula Egelson, and W. Todd Rogers. Paula Egelson has been president of CREATE, and as the CREATE representative to the JSCEE, she has been a long-standing member of the CREATE board of directors.

As it became time to revise the Student Evaluation Standards, CREATE conferences emphasized these sessions. According to Muñoz,

As an organization, we need to strike a great balance among teaching-embedded formative assessment, classroom assessment, benchmark assessment, and our annual state tests (particularly if the state test is instructionally sensitive—another issue for further discussion). The bottom line is to develop our pre-service and in-service teachers in the area of assessment literacy as expressed in our treasured *Student Evaluation Standards*. (2009, p. 1)

In 2010, CREATE was still conveying to its members the information that the Student Evaluation Standards were under revision. Then-President Barbara Howard stated:

The Board members have planned an exceptional line-up of speakers, events, and sessions, which will highlight the *Student Evaluation Standards*, currently under revision by the Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. NEI participants, as CREATE members represented on the Joint Committee, will be invited to share in this important revision work. (2010b, p. 1)

In 2015, the JCSEE modified the Student Evaluation Standards by publishing the Classroom Assessment Standards. CREATE members were essential for the development of these standards. CREATE member Don A. Klinger was co-chair of the task force that developed these standards. Barbara Howard, Marco Muñoz, and W. Todd Rogers served on the task force. Importantly, Muñoz, Klinger, and Howard have served as presidents of CREATE.

Even though the Personnel Evaluation Standards, Classroom Assessment Standards and Student Evaluation Standards are separate from the Program Evaluation Standards and are not our focus, they demonstrate the ongoing and interconnected work of the JCSEE and CREATE.

### *JCSEE and CREATE Going Forward Together*

Arlen R. Gullickson summarized CREATE's impact on using the Program Evaluation Standards in his 2016 CREATE presentation, *A Focus on Standards Research*: "We can't provide a standards book to educators and expect them to 'swallow' it whole." CREATE has been disseminating and promoting the use of the Program Evaluation Standards, in small chunks and their entirety, since CREATE's founding in 1991.

In that same 2016 presentation, Gullickson went on to challenge CREATE and the JCSEE to plot a path by joining forces:

- to establish a research planning team,
- to conduct small and specific congruence and contingency analyses of the use of the three sets of standards put out by the JCSEE, and
- to look for ways to inject research into ongoing funded projects.

The infrastructure for such a path exists: a CREATE representative is part of the JCSEE and ongoing interconnections between the two organizations at the annual CREATE conference. As we make sense of the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic, CREATE, and JCSEE are at an optimal time to enhance this established partnership.

CREATE seeks input from the JCSEE as CREATE examines the work of the organization. Writing this article drew us into periods of CREATE's history when the organization interrupted regular activities to regroup and make sense of the state of affairs to plot a path forward. Carl Hanssen chronicled the path CREATE took circa 1994 through 1996, when CREATE used the annual gathering to establish the work of the organization as it became an independent professional organization. In 2014, John Fischetti, CREATE president, led the "revitalization of our CREATE network of colleagues from the classroom to the board room" (2014a, p. 1). CREATE held sessions to make sense of where CREATE has been and where it is now to plot a path forward at the 2022 CREATE conference in Asheville, North Carolina, on October 10 and 11.

CREATE is considering pulling from the approaches that have been taken in the past, from 1994-2013; CREATE held evaluation institutes rather than conferences. The CREATE board of directors has asked for JCSEE's partnership in mapping out a one- to three-year plan that is situated within the criteria for success and action steps to be taken if criteria are not met. Even though this process may interrupt or postpone regular CREATE business, the CREATE board of directors

believes it is a necessary collaborative endeavor to ensure our influence on the theoretical development and applied practice of evaluation.

## Conclusion

To conclude this examination of CREATE's impact on the theoretical development and applied use of the Program Evaluation Standards, we return to CREATE's mission:

- (a) to advance the field of educational evaluation through a national forum for the presentation, discussion, and dissemination of sound practices of personnel, student, and program evaluation research and policy;
- (b) to facilitate a network among those who actively engage in personnel, program, and/or student evaluations and those who benefit from such evaluations; and
- (c) to promote the development, dissemination, knowledge, and use of the personnel, program, and student evaluation standards as issued by the Joint Committee on Standards in Educational Evaluation.

Along with the JCSEE, CREATE has collaboratively operationalized the theoretical foundation of evaluation so that the Program Evaluation Standards continue to be used in applied settings. Furthermore, CREATE has been an outlet for JCSEE. JCSEE and CREATE shared revised standards and held national panels at CREATE conferences. CREATE encourages those already familiar with the standards to apply them in their work in a broad range of settings. CREATE asks the JCSEE to join us as we take a lesson from our collective past to regroup and plot a path forward in evaluation, the "task in the best tradition of the most abstract theoretical science as well as the most practical applied science" (Scriven, 1968, p. 9).

### Limitations

While examining the ways members of CREATE have used the Program Evaluation Standards since 1991, we discovered that the organization needs to track down archived and missing conference schedules, programs, and relevant files. Access to those materials would provide additional information of CREATE's promotion and dissemination of the Program Evaluation Standards from 1991 to 2004 and for other years within which CREATE has been active. Importantly, this work has led to a better structure for storing and accessing CREATE's documents and publications since 1991.

## References

- Airasian, P. W. (1997). CREATE news. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(1), 89–92.
- Airasian, P. W. (2004). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Colorado Springs, Colorado, United States of America.
- Airasian, P. W., & Gullickson, A. (1994). Examination of teacher self-assessment. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 195–203.
- Airasian, P., & Horn, S. (1998). Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(4), 381–383.
- Airasian, P. W., & Horn, S. (2000a). CREATE news: Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(1), 89–93.
- Airasian, P. W., & Horn, S. (2000b). CREATE news: Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(4), 319–327.
- Bartels, L. M. (1988). *Presidential primaries and the dynamics of public choice*. Princeton University Press.
- Beaton, A. E., Martin, M. O., Mullis, I. V. S., Gonzalez, E. I., Smith, T. A., Kelly, D. L. (1998). Create news: Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation: Mathematics and science achievement in the middle school years: An international perspective. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 12(1), 69–73.
- CREATE (2006). Opportunity to apply standards to your work: Call for Proposals: National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *CREATE Newsletter*, 9(2), 5.
- CREATE. (2006). Personnel evaluation with Dr. Barbara Howard, student evaluation with Dr. Arlen Gullickson and program evaluation with Dr. Don Yarbrough [Post-conference sessions]. Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation at the National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational

- Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Dallas, Texas, United States of America.
- CREATE Board of Directors. (2012). CREATE 2012–2015 Strategic Goals.
- CREATE Board of Directors. (2013, September 11). CREATE 2012–2015 Strategic Goals, Version 2.0.
- CREATE Board of Directors. (2014, January 16). DRAFT Consortium Document.
- CREATE Board of Directors. (2015, February 6). Agenda and Minutes, CREATE Winter Board Meeting. Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teaching Effectiveness (CREATE).
- CREATE Business Meeting. (2015, October 17). CREATE Mission Statement (Current) and (Revised).
- CREATE Bylaws. art. IV, § 3.C.
- CREATE News. (1999). *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 13(3), 295.
- CREATE Newsletter. (2009). Keynote Speakers for the 2009 NEI. *CREATE Newsletter*, 12 (4), 4.
- CREATE. (2010). *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (2), 7.
- CREATE website. (2018). Prior 2018 Website Content. Davis, D., & Muñoz, M. A. (2007). Highlights from the 2007 National Evaluation Institute October 4-6, 2007, The Rosen Centre Hotel, Orlando, Florida. *CREATE Newsletter*, 11 (1), 2–3.
- Dearmin, E. T. (1994). Assonance and dissonance in teacher preparation: Moving across state boundaries. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 119–134.
- Dwyer, C. A. (1994). Criteria for performance-based teacher assessments: Validity, standards, and issues. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 135–150.
- Dwyer, C.A. (2004). *Keynote Address*. [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Colorado Springs, Colorado, United States of America.
- Egelson, P. (2010). Joint Committee on Standards for Education Evaluation. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (3), 2.
- Egelson, P. (2012). Message from the President. *CREATE Newsletter*, 16 (1), 1.
- Egelson, P. (2014). CREATE Conference 2013 reflections – Atlanta, Georgia, October 1–12, 2013. *CREATE Newsletter*, 17 (1), 2.
- Egelson, P., & Howard, B. (2008). Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation: Enhancing personnel evaluations through an application of the standards. *CREATE Newsletter*, 11 (2), 2.
- Egelson, P., Lee, S., Franchini, A., Donnelly, L., Freeman, C., & McCaslin, R. (2010). *Using the Program Evaluation Standards to assist in implementing alternative school program evaluation* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Williamsburg, Virginia, United States of America.
- Egelson, P., Purser, R., & Fuga, C. (2018). *Implementing the Program Evaluation Standards in real-time settings* [Conference session]. The Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teacher Effectiveness, High Point, North Carolina, United States of America.
- Ellett, C. D. (1999). Special editorial announcements. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 3(3), 199–200.
- Ellett, C. D. (2000). From the editor. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(4), 283–284.
- Ellett, C. D. (2001). From the editor. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 15(1), 5–6.
- Ellett, C. D., Loup, K. S., & Stronge, J. H. (1997). From the new editors. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(1), 5–6.
- Fischetti, J. (2014a). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 17 (1), 1.
- Fischetti, J. (2014b). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 17 (2), 1.
- Gullickson, A. R. (2008). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Wilmington, North Carolina, United States of America.
- Gullickson, A. R. (2016). *A focus on standards research* [Conference session]. The Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teacher Effectiveness, Louisville, Kentucky, United States of America.
- Gullickson, A. R., & Howard, B. (2009). *The personnel evaluation standards: How to assess systems for evaluating educators* (2nd ed.). Corwin Press.
- Gullickson, A. R., Howard, B., & Egelson, P. (2004). *The Program Evaluation Standards* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Colorado Springs, Colorado, United States of America.
- Hanssen, C. (1996). Beyond CREATE: The beginnings of a new national organization for educational accountability and teacher

- evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 10(1), 7–10.
- Horn, S. P., & Airasian, P. W. (1997). Create news: Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 11(2), 197–200.
- Horn, S., & Airasian, P. (1999). CREATE NEWS: Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 13(1), 95–99.
- Howard, B. (2007). [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Orlando, Florida, United States of America.
- Howard, B. (2010a). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (1), 1.
- Howard, B. (2010b). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (2), 1.
- Howard, B. (2010c). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (3), 1.
- Howard, B. (2010d). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13 (4), 1.
- Howard, B., & Muñoz, M. (2012). The Classroom Assessment Standards: A guide to best practices on assessment for teachers and administrators in pre-K – 12 classrooms. *CREATE Newsletter*, 16(1), 6–7.
- Iwanicki, E. F. (1991). About this issue. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 5(1), 5.
- Iwanicki, E. F. (1992). About this issue. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 5(3), 243–244.
- Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. (1981). *Standards for evaluations of educational programs, projects, and materials*. McGraw-Hill.
- Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. (1988). *The Personnel Evaluation Standards*. Sage.
- Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. (2003). *The Student Evaluation Standards*. Corwin.
- Kam, C. D., & Zechmeister, E. J. (2013). Name recognition and candidate support. *American Journal of Political Science*, 57(4), 971–986. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajps.12034>
- Klinger, C. R., & Klinger, D. A. (2021). Regarding evaluation. *2020 Annual Conference Proceedings of the Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teacher Effectiveness*, 1, 28–30. [https://uploads-ssl.webflow.com/623e877dd599265fa93c3790/62b4f6c5fd674f1b61271e21\\_2021.CREATE.pdf](https://uploads-ssl.webflow.com/623e877dd599265fa93c3790/62b4f6c5fd674f1b61271e21_2021.CREATE.pdf)
- Klinger, C. R., & Klinger, D. (2021, October). Unresolved controversy: Assessment & evaluation [Conference session]. The Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teaching Effectiveness. Virtual Conference.
- Klinger, D. A., McDivitt, P. R., Howard, B. B., Muñoz, M. A., Rogers, W. T., & Wylie, E. C. (2015). *The Classroom Assessment Standards for preK–12 teachers*. Kindle Direct Press.
- Krathwohl, D. R. (2009). Historical research, chapter 25. In D. R. Krathwohl (Ed.), *Methods of educational and social science research: The logic of methods* (pp. 605–614). Waveland Press.
- Linn, R. (2004). *Keynote Address*. [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Colorado Springs, Colorado, United States of America.
- Marzano, R. (2004). *Keynote Address*. [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Colorado Springs, Colorado, United States of America.
- McDivitt, P. J., Klinger, D. A., Howard, B., Muñoz, M., Rogers, W. T., & Wylie, C. (2011). Classroom Assessment Standards (formerly known as Student Evaluation Standards). *CREATE Newsletter*, 15(1), 4.
- Muñoz, M. A. (2006). Highlights of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE): Expanding Research and Promising Practices in Personnel, Program, and Student Evaluation [Special issue]. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 19(1/2), 1–3.
- Muñoz, M. A. (2007). Forthcoming change on CREATE's journal. *CREATE Newsletter*, 11 (1), 5.
- Muñoz, M. (2009). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 12(1), 1.
- Muñoz, M. (2010). The Student Evaluation Standards: A helpful tool for implementing assessment for learning. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13(2), 2–3.
- Muñoz, M. A., & Chang, F. C. (2007). The elusive relationship between teacher characteristics and student academic growth: A longitudinal multilevel model for change. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 20(3/4), 147–164.
- Muñoz, M., & Chang, F. (2008). *CREATE Newsletter*, 11(2), 8.

- Muñoz, M. A. & Davis, D. R. (2007). Improving teaching and learning through evaluation: A special issue on the National Evaluation Institute, Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE) [Special issue]. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 20(3/4), 111–116.
- Muñoz, M., & Rodosky, R. (2010). Teaching-embedded formative assessment to improve student learning: A perspective from the field. *CREATE Newsletter*, 13(1), 4–5.
- Nevo, D. (1994). How can teachers benefit from teacher evaluation? *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 109–117.
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods: Integrating theory and practice* (4th ed.). Sage.
- Rodosky, R. (2003). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 7(1), 1.
- Rodosky, R. (2005). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 9(1), 1.
- Rodosky, R. (2009). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Louisville, Kentucky, United States of America.
- Rodosky, R. (2022, August 6). Robert Rodosky. LinkedIn. <https://www.linkedin.com/in/robert-rodosky-75417417/>
- Ross, A. (2015, June 23). Longtime JCPS administrator Rodosky to retire. *The Courier Journal*. <https://www.courier-journal.com/story/news/education/2015/06/23/longtime-jcps-administrator-rodosky-retire/29183621/>
- Sanders, J. R., & Joint Committee on Standards for Educational Evaluation. (1994). *The program evaluation standards: How to assess evaluations of educational programs* (2nd ed.). Sage.
- Sanders, W. L. (2000a). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, San Jose, California, United States of America.
- Sanders, W. L. (2000b). Value-added assessment from student achievement data: Opportunities and hurdles: CREATE National Evaluation Institute, July 21, 2000. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(4), 329–339.
- Schwab, R. L. (1990). About this issue. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 4(1), 5–6.
- Scriven, M. (1967). The methodology of evaluation. In R. W. Tyler, R. M. Gagné & M. Scriven (Eds.), *Perspectives of curriculum evaluation* (vol. 1, pp. 39-83). Rand McNally & Company.
- Scriven, M. (1968). *Evaluation as a main aim of science: Comments on Professor Bloom's paper entitled toward a theory of testing which includes measurement-evaluation-assessment* [CSE Report 10]. University of California, Los Angeles, Center for the Study of Evaluation.
- Scriven, M. (1991). *Evaluation thesaurus* (4th ed.). Sage.
- Scriven, M. (1994). Duties of the teacher. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 151–184.
- Scriven, M. (2001). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Wilmington, North Carolina, United States of America.
- Scriven, M. (2016). Roadblocks to recognition and revolution. *The American Journal of Evaluation*, 37(1), 27–44. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098214015617847>
- Shinkfield, A. J., & Stufflebeam, D. L. (1995). *Teacher evaluation: Guide to effective practice*. Springer Netherlands.
- Stronge, J. H. (2012). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture*. [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Washington, D.C., United States of America.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (1971). The Relevance of the CIPP evaluation model for educational accountability. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 5(1), 19–25.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (1991). An introduction to the Center for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation (CREATE). *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 5(1), 85–92.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (1999). *Jason Millman Memorial Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Travers City, Michigan, United States of America.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2000). The methodology of metaevaluation as reflected in metaevaluations by the Western Michigan University Evaluation

- Center. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 14(1), 95–125.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2004). A note on the purposes, development, and applicability of the Joint Committee Evaluation Standards. *The American Journal of Evaluation*, 25(1), 99–102.
- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2009). Keynote address [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Louisville, Kentucky, United States of America.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Egelson, P. (2016). *History of CREATE and Celebrating 25 Years of CREATE at This Year's CREATE Conference*.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Madaus, G. F. (1983). The standards for evaluation of educational programs, projects, and materials. In G.F. Madaus, M. S. Scriven, & D. L. Stufflebeam (Eds.), *Evaluation models: Evaluation in education and human services* (vol. 6, pp. 395-404). Springer. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-009-6669-7\\_23](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-009-6669-7_23)
- Stufflebeam, D. L. & Shrinkfield, A. J. (1985). Stufflebeam's improvement-Oriented evaluation. In D. L. Stufflebeam & A. J. Shrinkfield's (Eds.), *Systematic evaluation: A self-Instructional guide to theory and practice. Evaluation in education and human services* (vol 8, pp. 151-207). Springer.
- Stufflebeam, D. L., & Shinkfield, A. J. (1994). About this issue. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 103–108.
- Wetherill, K. (2006). Message from the president. *CREATE Newsletter*, 10(1), 1.
- Withers, G. (1994). Getting value from teacher evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education*, 8(2), 185–194.
- Yarbrough, D. B. (2008). National Hearing on JCSEE Standards [Conference session]. The National Evaluation Institute of the Consortium for Research on Educational Accountability and Teacher Evaluation, Wilmington, North Carolina, United States of America.
- Yarbrough, D. B. (2019). *2019 Jason Millman Award & Lecture* [Conference session]. The Consortium for Research on Educational Assessment and Teacher Effectiveness, High Point, North Carolina, United States of America.
- Yarbrough, D. B., Shulha, L. M., Hopson, R. K., & Caruthers, F. A. (2011). *The program evaluation standards: A guide for evaluators and evaluation users* (3rd ed.). Sage. <https://evaluationstandards.org/program/>